

**LOCAL DEMOCRACY AND BOUNDARY COMMISSION FOR WALES  
MEETING**

**HELD ON 26 NOVEMBER 2019 AT HASTINGS HOUSE**

*This document is available in Welsh*

**Present:** Mr Ceri Stradling (Interim Chair); Mr David Powell (Interim Deputy Chair); Mrs Julie May and Mr Theodore Joloza.

**LDBCW Officers attending:** Mrs Shereen Williams (Chief Executive); Mr Dave Carr (Finance Manager); Mr Tom Jenkins (Review Manager); Mr Huw Blacker (Review Officer); Mr Rhys Brooks (Review Officer); Mrs Catherine Thomas (Business Support Officer); Mr Nathan Sweetman (Business Support Officer).

**Time Started:** 10:15

**Time Finished:** 14:45

**Apologies:** Matt Redmond (Deputy Chief Executive)

**1. Declarations of Interest**

- 1.1. Nathan Sweetman declared an interest in the Vale of Glamorgan.
- 1.2. Tom Jenkins declared an interest in Rhondda Cynon Taf.

The Chair did not consider that any of the declared interests prevented the officers concerned taking a full part in discussions except when the electoral ward specific to an individual was under consideration

**2. Chair's Briefing**

- 2.1. The Chair congratulated Mr Matthew and Mrs Caroline Redmond on the birth of their first child.
- 2.2. The Chair led discussions regarding the commencement of the Monmouthshire electoral review. At the last meeting with the Welsh Government, it was reported that the Monmouthshire Community Order was being drafted and there would be an update within the next few weeks.
- 2.3. The Chair informed the meeting that the Welsh Government has indicated that the first electoral review Orders should be completed by May/June 2020 and that the Welsh Government will formally inform the Commission when an Order is made.

- 2.4. The Chair updated the meeting on the appointment of a new LDBCW Chair. The recruitment process has been completed, an appointment is imminent and there should be an announcement before Christmas.
- 2.5. The Swansea Tidal Lagoon issue was discussed as Welsh Government officials are likely to present the existing review with options to the Minister.
- 2.6. The Local Government Bill was discussed in relation to STV and voluntary mergers. The Commission **agreed** to submit written evidence to the Committee.
- 2.7. A recent One Voice Wales report was discussed in relation to Community Council reviews.

### 3. **Minutes of the Commission meeting held on 29 October 2019**

- 3.1. It was **Resolved** to approve the minutes of the meeting as a correct record of the matters considered subject to two minor amendments.

### 4. **Issues Arising**

- 4.1. Consideration was given to the report dated 22 November 2019 by the Chief Executive.
- 4.2. It was **Resolved** to accept the Report and updated progress was noted on the following issues:
  - **(Issue 2)** The Small Workplace Health Award
  - **(Issue 3)** Additional Data for Reviews
  - **(Issue 5)** Local Government Bill
- 4.3. Regarding **(Issue 1)** The Change Programme, the Welsh Government is yet to issue 'Staff Survey' content for WGSB's and that is impacting the timescales for our staff survey. Regarding the update of key plans, values and monitoring, the Chief Executive will provide a list of what has been updated to the next LDBCW meeting.
- 4.4. Regarding **(Issue 4)** The Social Partnership Bill, the Chief Executive will draft a response for the next LDBCW meeting.

- 4.5. Regarding **(Issue 6)** the ICT Lessons Learned Report, it was reported that the last part of the ICT project, the transfer of phone lines, had been initiated. Also, it was **agreed** that Skype and IT training should be arranged for the Commissioners.

## 5. Swansea Electoral Review – Final Options

- 5.1. Consideration was given to the report dated 19 November 2019 by the Review Officer.
- 5.2. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 1 of Castle and St Thomas and **agreed option 2**. This option comprises the three electoral wards of Castle, St Thomas and Waterfront.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides some improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates a new single-member ward.
- Recognises the newer developments of the Waterfront as a distinct area.

**This option returns a total number of 7 members, an increase from 6.**

- 5.3. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name | Welsh Name |
|--------------|------------|
| Castle       | Y Castell  |
| St Thomas    | Sain Tomos |
| Waterfront   | Glannau    |

- 5.4. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 2 of Bishopston, Fairwood, Gower, Penclawdd and Pennard and **agreed option 1 the draft proposal**. This option comprises the five electoral wards of Bishopston, Fairwood, Gower, Penclawdd and Pennard.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides some improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.
- Supported by the representations received.

**This option returns a total number of 5 members, no change.**

5.5. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name | Welsh Name         |
|--------------|--------------------|
| Bishopston   | Llandeilo Ferwallt |
| Fairwood     | Llwynteg           |
| Gower        | Gŵyr               |
| Pen-clawdd   | Pen-clawdd         |
| Pennard      | Pennard            |

5.6. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 3 of Mayals, Newton, Oystermouth and West Cross and **agreed option 2**. This option comprises the three electoral wards of Mayals, Newton and Oystermouth.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split community.
- Fully conforms to some of the representations received
- Partially conforms to the representation received from the Council and the Conservative Group

**This option returns a total number of 6 members, no change.**

5.7. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name | Welsh Name    |
|--------------|---------------|
| Mayals       | Moelfryn      |
| Mumbles      | Mwmbwls       |
| West Cross   | Y Groesffordd |

- 5.8. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 4 of Dunvant, Killay North and Killay South and **agreed option 2**. This option comprises the electoral ward of Dunvant and Killay.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides significant improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.
- Supported by the representations received to not split the community of Killay

**This option returns a total number of 3 members, a decrease from the existing 4 members.**

| English Name       | Welsh Name     |
|--------------------|----------------|
| Dunvant and Killay | Dyfnant a Cilâ |

- 5.9. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 5 of Cockett and Gowerton and **agreed option 2**. This option comprises the three electoral wards of Cockett, Waunarlwydd and Gowerton.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Reduces the number of four-member wards.
- Supported by some of the representations received

**This option returns a total number of 6 members.**

- 5.10. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name | Welsh Name  |
|--------------|-------------|
| Cockett      | Y Cocyd     |
| Gowerton     | Tregŵyr     |
| Wauarlwyydd  | Wauarlwyydd |

- 5.11. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 6 of Kingsbridge, Lower Loughor and Upper Loughor and **agreed option 1 the draft proposal**. This option comprises the electoral ward of Lluchwr.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides significant improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.

**This option returns a total number of 3 members.**

- 5.12. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name | Welsh Name |
|--------------|------------|
| Lluchwr      | Lluchwr    |

- 5.13. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 7 of Gorseinon, Penllergaer and Penyroel and **agreed option 1 the draft proposal**. This option comprises the two electoral wards of Gorseinon and Penyroel, and Penllergaer.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides significant improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.
- Supported by the Council and Town Council

**This option returns a total number of 4 members, no change.**

- 5.14. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name            | Welsh Name              |
|-------------------------|-------------------------|
| Gorseinon and Penyrheol | Gorseinon a Phenyrrheol |
| Penllergaer             | Penlle'r-gaer           |

- 5.15. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 8 of Clydach, Llangyfelach, Mawr and Pontardulais and **agreed**

**option 2.** This option comprises the four electoral wards of Clydach, Llangyfelach, Pontardulais, and Pontiliw and Tircoed.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides significant improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.
- Conforms to the majority suggestion in the representation from the Council

**This option returns a total number of 7 members, an increase from 6 existing members.**

5.16. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name         | Welsh Name           |
|----------------------|----------------------|
| Clydach              | Clydach              |
| Pontardulais         | Pontarddulais        |
| Llangyfelach         | Llangyfelach         |
| Pontlliw and Tircoed | Pontlliw a Thir-coed |

5.17. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral ward for Region 9 of Llansamlet and **agreed option 2.** This option comprises the electoral ward of Llansamlet.

The following reason were noted in support of the decision:

- Creates no split communities.

**This option returns a total number of 4 members, no change.**

5.18. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name | Welsh Name |
|--------------|------------|
| Llansamlet   | Llansamlet |

## 6. Rhondda Cynon Taf Electoral Review – Final Options

6.1. Consideration was given to the report dated 19 November 2019 by the Review Officer.

6.2. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 1 of Cilfynydd, Cymmer, Glyncoch, Graig, Hawthorn, Pontypridd Town, Rhondda, Rhydfelen Central / Ilan, Taff's Well, Trallwng, Treforest and Ynysybwl and **agreed option 2**. This option comprises the twelve electoral wards of Cilfynydd, Cymmer, Glyncoch, Graig and Rhondda, Hawthorn and Lower Rhydfelen, Pontypridd Town, Upper Rhydfelen, Rhydfelen Central, Taff's Well, Trallwng, Treforest and Ynysybwl.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides significant improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.
- Conforms to many of the representations received

**This option returns a total number of 15 members, an increase from the existing 14 members.**

6.3. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name                  | Welsh Name                      |
|-------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Cilfynydd                     | Cilfynydd                       |
| Cymmer                        | Y Cymer                         |
| Glyncoch                      | Glyncoch                        |
| Graig and Pontypridd West     | Y Graig a Gorllewin Pontypridd  |
| Hawthorn and Lower Rhydfelen  | Y Ddraenen Wen a Rhydfelen Isaf |
| Pontypridd Town               | Tref Pontypridd                 |
| Rhydfelen Central             | Canol Rhydfelen                 |
| Upper Rhydfelen and Glyn-taff | Rhydfelen Uchaf a Glyn-taf      |
| Taffs Well                    | Ffynon Taf                      |
| Trallwng                      | Trallwng                        |
| Treforest                     | Treforest                       |
| Ynysybwl                      | Ynysybwl                        |

- 6.4. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 2 of Church Village, Llantwit Fardre and Ton-teg and **agreed option 1 the draft proposal**. This option comprises the three electoral wards of Church Village, Llantwit Fardre and Ton-teg.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.
- Conforms to all the representations received
- Reflects that the three areas have distinct identities

**This option returns a total number of 5 members, no change.**

- 6.5. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name    | Welsh Name          |
|-----------------|---------------------|
| Church Village  | Pentre'r Eglwys     |
| Llantwit Fardre | Llanilltud Faerdref |
| Ton-teg         | Ton-teg             |

- 6.6. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral ward for Region 3 of Beddau, Llantrisant Town, Talbot Green and Tyn-y-nant and **agreed option 1 the draft proposal**. This option comprises the two electoral wards of Beddau and Tyn-y-nant, and Llantrisant Town and Talbot Green.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.
- Partially conforms to some of the representations received
- The representation to add an extra member to Beddau and Tyn-y-nant would have taken the Council over the 75-member limit

**This option returns a total number of 4 members, no change.**

- 6.7. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name | Welsh Name |
|--------------|------------|
|--------------|------------|

|                              |                              |
|------------------------------|------------------------------|
| Beddau and Tyn-y-nant        | Beddau a Thyn-y-nant         |
| Llantrisant and Talbot Green | Llantrisant a Thonysguborion |

- 6.8. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 4 of Llanharry and Pont-y-clun and **agreed option 2**. This option comprises the four electoral wards of Llanharry, Pont-y-clun Central, Pont-y-clun East and Pont-y-clun West.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides significant improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.

**This option returns a total number of 4 members, an increase from three existing members.**

- 6.9. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name        | Welsh Name            |
|---------------------|-----------------------|
| Llanharry           | Llanhari              |
| Pont-y-clun Central | Canol Pont-y-clun     |
| Pont-y-clun East    | Dwyrain Pont-y-clun   |
| Pont-y-clun West    | Gorllewin Pont-y-clun |

- 6.10. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 5 of Brynna and Llanharan and **agreed option 1 the draft proposal**. This option comprises the electoral ward of Brynna and Llanharan.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides significant improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.
- The ward remains at an appropriate level of variance from the county average.

**This option returns a total number of 3 members, an increase from two existing members.**

6.11. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name         | Welsh Name         |
|----------------------|--------------------|
| Brynna and Llanharan | Brynna a Llanharan |

6.12. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 6 of Tonyrefail West and **agreed option 1 the draft proposal**. This option comprises the electoral ward of Tonyrefail West.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides significant improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.
- Conforms to all representations received

**This option returns a total number of 2 members, an increase from one member.**

6.13. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name    | Welsh Name           |
|-----------------|----------------------|
| Tonyrefail West | Gorllewin Tonyrefail |

6.14. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 7 of Llwyn-y-pia, Pentre, Trealaw, Treherbert, Treorchy and Ystrad and **agreed option 2**. This option comprises the six electoral wards of Llwyn-y-pia, Pentre, Trealaw, Treherbert, Treorchy and Ystrad.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides moderate improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.

**This option returns a total number of 10 members, a decrease from eleven members.**

6.15. Based upon the representations received, and the Secretariat's preferred Option. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name | Welsh Name |
|--------------|------------|
|--------------|------------|

|             |             |
|-------------|-------------|
| Llwyn-y-pia | Llwyn-y-pia |
| Pentre      | Pentre      |
| Trealaw     | Trealaw     |
| Treherbert  | Treherbert  |
| Treorchy    | Treorci     |
| Ystrad      | Ystrad      |

- 6.16. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 8 of Ferndale, Maerdy, Tylorstown and Ynyshir and **agreed option 1 the draft proposal**, but retaining the existing ward names. This option comprises the two electoral wards of Maerdy and Ferndale and Tylorstown and Ynyshir.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides moderate improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.

**This option returns a total number of 4 members, a decrease from six existing members.**

- 6.17. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name           | Welsh Name            |
|------------------------|-----------------------|
| Ferndale and Maerdy    | Glynrhedynog a Maerdy |
| Tylorstown and Ynyshir | Tylorstown ac Ynyshir |

- 6.18. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 9 of Hirwaun and Rhigos and **agreed option 1 the draft proposal**. This option comprises the electoral ward of Hirwaun and Rhigos.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides significant improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.

**This option returns a total number of 2 members, no change.**

6.19. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as recommended below:

| English Name                 | Welsh Name                   |
|------------------------------|------------------------------|
| Hirwaun, Penderyn and Rhigos | Hirwaun, Penderyn a'r Rhigos |

6.20. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 10 of Aberaman North, Aberaman South, Cwmbach, Mountain Ash East and Mountain Ash West and **agreed option 1 the draft proposal**. This option comprises the three electoral wards of Aberaman, Cwmbach and Mountain Ash.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides significant improvements to electoral parity.
- Creates no split communities.

**This option returns a total number of 7 members, a decrease from eight existing members.**

6.21. The Secretariat recommends adopting the names as below:

| English Name | Welsh Name |
|--------------|------------|
| Aberaman     | Aberaman   |
| Cwmbach      | Cwmbach    |
| Mountain Ash | Aberpennar |

## 7. The Vale of Glamorgan Electoral Review - Draft Options

7.1. Consideration was given to the Report dated 19 November 2019 by the Review Officer.

7.2. The Commission considered the proposals for the existing electoral wards for Region 1 of Cowbridge, Llandow/Ewenny, Llantwit Major, St. Athan and St. Bride's Major and **agreed option 2**. This option comprises the five electoral wards of Cowbridge, Llandow, Llantwit Major, St. Athan and St. Bride's Major.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Provides a better overall electoral parity.
- Improves the electoral variance for the St Athan and St Bride's electoral wards with minimal changes to the existing arrangements.
- Provides the best electoral parity for the area while maintaining community ties and transport links as much as possible.
- Conforms in part to the representations received

**This option returns a total number of 12 members, an increase from the existing 10.**

7.3. The Commission considered the proposals for the electoral wards for Region 2 of Baruc, Buttrills, Cadoc, Castleland, Court, Dyfan, Gibbonsdown and Illtyd and **agreed option 2**. This option comprises the eight electoral wards of Baruc, Buttrills, Cadoc, Castleland, Court, Dyfan, Gibbonsdown and Illtyd.

The following reasons were noted in support of the decision:

- Creates no split Communities.
- Retains a number of existing wards
- Provides significant improvements to electoral parity.

**Option 2 returns a total number of 20 members. An increase from the existing 18.**

7.4. The Commission considered the existing arrangements for the Cadoc ward and it is the view of the Commission that a three-member ward would return a high level of electoral variance. The Commission has therefore made an exception to its policy to not create any new four-member wards. The Commission is of the view that it is appropriate to do this in this instance but would welcome suggestions for alternative arrangements.

## **9. Risk Management – Risk Register**

9.1 Consideration was given to the Report dated 13 November 2019 by the Finance Manager. It was **noted** that the changes agreed at the last meeting had been implemented.

- 9.2 It was **agreed** that Risk CR2 Stage 5 and Stage 7 mitigating actions could now be deleted as the JEGS Exercise had been completed and the recommendations fully considered.
- 9.3 It was **agreed** that a new mitigating action should be added to risk CR3 to reflect dealing with the complaint received regarding the Bridgend Electoral Review.
- 9.4 It was **agreed** that a new mitigating action should be added to risk CR5 regarding the decision to increase the number of ARAC members by an additional Commissioner until a new Chair was appointed.
- 9.5 It was **agreed** that risk CR7 could be removed from the risk register in January if the phone system had been successfully upgraded.

## **10. Budget Report**

- 10.1 Consideration was given to the Report dated 13 November 2019 by the Finance Manager. Members noted and agreed the proposed transfer of funds between budget categories.
- 10.2 The current budget position and estimated annual underspend was noted. The estimated year-end position was discussed and Members noted the coming expenditure requirements outlined by the Chief Executive.

## **11. Board Effectiveness Assessment**

- 11.1 Consideration was given to the Report dated 13 November 2019 by the Finance Manager.
- 11.2 The Commission noted the outcome of the assessment exercise. An analysis of the responses was considered and there was discussion regarding those questions to which members had responded differently.
- 11.3 It was agreed that the Management team would complete the questionnaire at their December meeting. The results of which would help inform any further action required.

## **12. Reviews Progress Report**

- a. Consideration was given to the Report dated 18 November by the Deputy Chief Executive, including a further analysis of average ratios by category of Authority.

- b. It was **noted** that the December General Election had delayed the publication of some electoral review reports.
- c. It was **agreed** to add Council Size Aim Analysis to the Review Progress Timetable.
- d. The content of the rest of the report was **noted**.

### **13. Calendar of Events**

- a. The Commission **noted** the calendar and the upcoming meetings in January with Monmouthshire and Newport Councils which are to be added.

### **14. Any Other Relevant Business**

- a. A letter of complaint from Bridgend County Borough Council in relation to the Electoral Review was considered.

**Date of Next Meeting: 17 December 2019**